

- [Log In](#)
- [Register Now](#)
  
- [Home Page](#)
- [Today's Paper](#)
- [Video](#)
- [Most Popular](#)

### [U.S. Edition](#)

- [Global Edition](#)
- [中文网 \(Chinese\)](#)

Search All NYTimes.com

**The New York Times**

Sunday, July 28, 2013

## [News](#)

- [World](#)
- [U.S.](#)
- [N.Y. / Region](#)
- [Business](#)
- [Technology](#)
- [Science](#)
- [Health](#)
- [Sports](#)
- [Opinion](#)
- [Arts](#)
- [Style](#)
- [Travel](#)
- [Jobs](#)

- [Real Estate](#)
- [Autos](#)

---

[Advertise on NYTimes.com](#)

---

## The Lede

Blogging the News With Robert Mackey



---

November 29, 2008, 7:54 am

# Update on Nariman House Victims

By [HEATHER TIMMONS](#)

NEW DELHI — Rabbi Gavriel Holtzberg, his wife, Rivka, and six others killed in Nariman House during the Mumbai terrorist attacks may have died as early as Wednesday, people investigating the site said.

The Holtzbergs' nanny, who took the couple's toddler son Moshe from the building soon after the attacks started, told investigators that she saw the rabbi and his wife lying on the floor covered in blood when she left.

At least six, and possibly seven, other victims were killed in the Mumbai headquarters of Jewish group Chabad, people involved in the investigation said. Chabad officials have identified two of the dead as Leibish Teitelbaum, a rabbi from Brooklyn living in Israel, and Bentzion Chroman, an Israeli with dual American citizenship.

The identities and number of the remaining victims were still unknown as of Saturday afternoon. One person who had been in the building said some of the victims' faces were unrecognizable after the attacks. Many of the bodies were found covered in a Jewish prayer shawl.

Israeli officials praised India's handling of the attacks on Saturday, countering a report that Israeli security experts were unhappy with the Indian response. "We have nothing but the greatest respect" for the Indian security authorities, Mark Sofer, the Israeli ambassador to India, said in a telephone interview. They handled a "extremely complex and difficult situation" in the best way possible, he said.

- Facebook
- Twitter
- Google+
- E-mail
- Share
- [Print](#)

[News](#), [India](#), [Israel](#), [Mumbai](#), [Terrorism](#)

## Related Posts

### From The Lede

- [Video Shows Suspected Bomber Before Deadly Attack on Israelis in Bulgaria](#)
- [Somber Scenes in France and Israel as Shooting Victims Are Eulogized](#)
- [Indian Reporter Witnessed Attack on Israeli Diplomat's Wife](#)
- [Angered by Shalit Deal, Israeli Defaces Rabin Memorial](#)
- [Israeli Columnist Is Fired for Writing That Palestinian Terrorism Is 'Justified'](#)

- 
- Previous Post [Mumbai Attacks, Updates Day 3](#)
  - Next Post [Mumbai Attacks, the Aftermath](#)

## 19 Comments

1. 1. November 29, 2008 12:03 pm [Link](#)

Now, perhaps, India will do more to protect places like Nariman House. There's nothing to be done for those who have already been murdered. But maybe now others who might have been injured or killed will have the protection security forces posted on a continuous basis.

— *Abarafi*

2. 2. November 29, 2008 3:48 pm [Link](#)

Many were killed and injured in this terrible siege. We must learn that no amount of "protection security forces" can prevent another attack of terrorism anywhere. The only protection is the goodness of the human heart, something we have lost as civilization has become less civil and less tolerant of others.

Only WE can work to end the hatred amongst us. We are failing miserably.

— *Constance*

3. 3. November 29, 2008 4:38 pm [Link](#)

Abarafi, in fairness to India's incompetence in protecting all ten of the locations, they were unprepared everywhere.

Not simply at the Chabad House.

— *Bush leaves a healthy world state of terrorism as his legacy.*

4. 4. November 29, 2008 5:24 pm [Link](#)

After reading numerous news reports from multiple sources and watching videos of the terror attacks, the moment for unstoppable tears for me came when I read news and saw footage of the deaths of Rabbi Holtzberg and his wife Rivka.

Their senseless deaths strike at the very heart of Indian secularism in our unprecedented democracy. I have Jewish friends in Mumbai. The Chabad Lubavitch are most welcome in India and always will be.

I hope the Chabad Lubavitch will continue to add to the richness of the diversity that is unmistakably and inimitably India. India will be poorer if they were to leave.

<http://www.EthicalDemocracy.blogspot.com>

Chithra KarunaKaran

— *Chithra KarunaKaran*

5. 5. November 29, 2008 7:04 pm [Link](#)

I worked for the Obama campaign and I have never been a supporter of Bush or his policies. However, I think some credit should be given to his judgment regarding India. He sensed that India was a stable power in the region and signed a historic nuclear treaty with the country. He has also responded promptly to this attack, offering his help and sympathy and affirming the resilience of India in a statement.

Bush may have been misguided in his strategy, but this tragedy reminds us again of the terrorism he had to confront. It's not an easy issue for anyone to handle and we can't just blame him for the legacy of terrorism. We have to go back further to the earlier policies of the United States, the Cold War and British imperialism.

The best strategy perhaps is to freeze the petro-dollars that finance such operations. Switching to a different source of energy may do more to contain violence than launching war.

— *OrWriter*

6. 6. November 29, 2008 7:55 pm [Link](#)

Chabad Lubavitch believes strongly in diversity, and in bringing hospitality to Jews throughout the world. they are great neighbors, and loving friends. They represent some fine Torah qualities, and I am certain that they will rebuild, probably before even the hotels.

— *Mike*

7. 7. November 29, 2008 9:05 pm [Link](#)

Honestly, I think that this was the stupidest most illogical move made by the terrorists killing Jews and killing foreigners particularly Americans. Once the terrorists did that forget it, they angered two dangerous nations America and Israel. You can act smart and do whatever you want to India, but once they killed Israelis and Americans these terrorists were in very very hot water. Israel and America are very very very strong on terrorism, and are fervent in any terrorist activities. Look at Gitmo and the Patriot Act and wiretapping if you have any doubts.

— *Andrew*

8. 8. November 30, 2008 1:38 am [Link](#)

This is a tragic wake up call for Chabad as well as it's host cities abroad. These important centers, staffed by such fine people, need the same protection as El Al or the Israeli consular offices.

— *gll*

9. 9. November 30, 2008 4:34 am [Link](#)

The whole world is grieving for the violent murders, mutilations and violations that has been wreaked on the victims in Mumbai. We cry in unison with the families, the friends, the citizens of Mumbai. We pray together in whatever form of religion or form of unaffiliated, caring

thoughts, but we all pray together that from this evil, Love will rise and overcome.

— *Joyce Boll*

10. 10. November 30, 2008 4:51 am [Link](#)

I am so haunted by that dear child, Moshe. I thank God he will have no recollection of this horror. To be left crying stained with the blood of his parents? What kind of sick monsters roam this world? I feel enraged and gutted at the same time.

— *Marie*

11. 11. November 30, 2008 10:10 am [Link](#)

My condolences to the families and friends people who died at Chabad house. Now that said, here is a stupid comment.

“Now, perhaps, India will do more to protect places like Nariman House.”

Don't expect everything from the Indian government. I mean it can't “protect” or “provide security” to all the private places in India. It doesn't have the money or resources. The people at Chabad house should hire private bodyguards and security personnel if they are concerned about their safety.

— *Arvi*

12. 12. November 30, 2008 11:16 am [Link](#)

The Holzbergs were so kind to us when we visited Mumbai during High Holidays in 05- they were caring, spirited and full of life. We were welcomed with joy and warm hospitality.

We felt so at home wherever we went in Mumbai and feel so heartbroken at this senseless murder.

I think that what there is to do in the face of this horror is to be kinder to each other and care for those of us in need even more in the memory of those whose lives were lived in that spirit.

Ahouva

— *Ahouva Steinhaus*

13. 13. November 30, 2008 11:54 am [Link](#)

History can reveal that every nation can avoid many incidents through their intelligence, however all cannot be avoided. Instead of blaming the Indian Forces, one should contemplate on the most complex and confusing situation the Security forces had to deal with. They have risked their lives and saved hundreds, so please respect that fact and be grateful to them. I salute our heroes who not only laid down their lives for Indians but

other nationalities as well. We always welcome the Israelis and other citizens, we always do the utmost to risk our lives before harm befalls them and this is evident from many foreign survivors stories in the terrorits aftermath.God bless India our Nation of diverse people.

– *Edward*

14. 14. November 30, 2008 12:48 pm [Link](#)

Is it true that when Israel wanted to help and commit troops to India – their offer was turned down? This could just be urban legend, but I wonder if this is true. The Israeli Special Units are completely trained in this kind of senseless slaughter/hostage situation . The CHABAD ORGANISATION do wonderful deeds of goodness wherever they are – they always are the first to go and help the wounded in any part of the world in which they do their wonderful work. India is indeed poorer for the terrible killings of this wonderful Rabbi and his dear wife and all other Israelis who perished with them. So sad, so unutterably sad.

– *Sybil F*

15. 15. November 30, 2008 9:21 pm [Link](#)

My condolences to the families of those who died in Mumbai. I am originally from India, a Hindu. I feel sad. My heart goes to the jewish people.We are together in these difficult times.

– *Ashok*

16. 16. December 1, 2008 9:02 am [Link](#)

The National Security Guards (NSG) did an amazing job and carried out the most complex of operations. Imagine, the HSG who had not clue of the layout of Taj, Trident and Nariman House.

Moreover, Nariman House is located in one of the most crowded areas with small alleys which are not difficult to access. On top of that, also think of other residents of the neighbouring buildings who were at high risk to the battle between the NSG and the militants.

Not only did the NSG eliminated all the militants, but also ensured that the entire operation was performed without harming the neighbouring residents. It was out of self-respect and self-confidence that India declined help from our good friend Israel. It should not be taken as an offence or with an ill feeling.

In fact, even Israel has praised the government's efforts to effectively tackle this precarious & dangerous situation. I salute our brave men who saved hundreds of lives and laid down their lives for the people from diverse countries.

Jai Hind!

– *Gautam Gohil*

17. 17. December 1, 2008 12:04 pm [Link](#)

I think it's so disappointing how security is priced at a premium from places where it should be a given. No amount of reinforcement born of hindsight can make up for this tragedy, but it will help honor the memory of the people who sacrificed their lives, victims, policemen and rescue workers alike.

– *Sayo Shiota*

18. 18. December 3, 2008 11:33 pm [Link](#)

#11

May be Arvi will do the honorable thing and head for Mumbai and Chabad House and give us all a break.

– *The Brave Arvi*

19. 19. December 4, 2008 8:38 am [Link](#)

Are we all still secure against terrorist after this serious attack in Mumbai? Please do something for our safety, dear leaders...!!

– *Yasmin Khan*

Comments are no longer being accepted.

### Search This Blog

- Previous Post [Mumbai Attacks, Updates Day 3](#)
- Next Post [Mumbai Attacks, the Aftermath](#)

• **Follow This Blog**

- [Twitter](#)
- [RSS](#)

### Reports and Commentary on Twitter



**mada** **Mada Masr** @MadaMasr 2h  
 An account of torture in Rabea  
[madamasr.com/content/accoun...](http://madamasr.com/content/accoun...)  
 Expand

**Rida** @libyanproud 2h  
 Scene of 1 of the explosions in Benghazi.  
[pic.twitter.com/0BnHf51SWn](http://pic.twitter.com/0BnHf51SWn)



## Recent Posts

July 27

[13](#)

### [Video and Witness Accounts of Attack on Islamist Protesters in Cairo](#)

Egypt's interior minister claimed that his officers "have never and will never shoot" one bullet at citizens, but video, photographs and written accounts contradicted that assertion.

July 26

### [Tahrir Taken, Some Egyptians Look for 'Third Square' to Resist Islamists and Army](#)

On a day of mass rallies by supporters of Egypt's army and the rival Muslim Brotherhood, some activists were left wondering how best to register their disgust with both the military and the Islamists.

July 26

[33](#)

[Video of San Diego Mayor Announcing His Plans to Undergo Therapy](#)

San Diego's Democratic Party leaders voted to ask Mayor Bob Filner to resign after four prominent female leaders disclosed that they had been subjected to unwanted sexual advances.

July 25

[101](#)

[Video of Juror Who Says George Zimmerman 'Got Away With Murder'](#)

A second juror in the George Zimmerman trial spoke publicly and said she believed Mr. Zimmerman was guilty of murder in the shooting of Trayvon Martin.

July 25

[31](#)

[Spanish Train Crash Captured on Video](#)


Security-camera footage leaked to the public via YouTube captured the moment on Wednesday that a passenger train derailed outside Santiago de Compostela in northwestern Spain, killing at least 78 people.

**About The Lede**

The Lede is a blog that remixes national and international news stories, adding information gleaned from the Web or gathered through original reporting to supplement articles in The New York Times and draw readers in to the global conversation about the news taking place online.

Readers are encouraged to take part in the blogging by using the comments threads to suggest links to relevant material elsewhere on the Web or by submitting eyewitness accounts, photographs or video of news events. [Read more.](#)

**Archive**

Select Month 

## Blogroll

### Analysis, Features and Documentaries

- [BBC Panorama](#)
- [BBC Radio 4](#)
- [Big Picture](#)
- [Frontline](#)
- [Have I Got News For You](#)
- [Institute for War & Peace Reporting/ Iran](#)
- [Iran Primer](#)
- [Miller-McCune](#)
- [Newsnight](#)
  
- [PBS NewsHour](#)
- [Room for Debate](#)
- [Slate](#)
- [The Center for Public Integrity](#)
- [The Daily Show](#)
- [The New Yorker](#)
- [Untold Stories](#)
- [Vanity Fair](#)

### Blogs

- [Adam Curtis](#)
- [Arabist](#)
- [At War](#)
- [China Digital Times](#)
- [City Room](#)
- [Close Read](#)
- [Coteret](#)

- [Cuminet](#)
- [Damascus Diaries](#)
- [Danger Room](#)
- [Dot Earth](#)
- [EA WorldView](#)
- [Feet in Two Worlds](#)
- [First Round Bye](#)
- [Foreign Policy: Passport](#)
- [Gary Sick](#)
- [Global Voices](#)
- [Heresy Corner](#)
- [Iranian Progressives in Translation](#)
- [Jarret Brachman](#)
- [Jonathan Turley](#)
- [Kottke](#)
  
- [Language Log](#)
- [Le Monde's News Blog](#)
- [Lens](#)
- [Murketing](#)
- [New Yorker's News Desk](#)
- [Now Lebanon](#)
- [NYRB Blog](#)
- [NYT: Moscow](#)
- [Pro Publica Blog](#)
- [Robin Wright](#)
- [Saudi Jeans](#)
- [Small Wars Journal](#)
- [Strange Maps](#)
- [Talking Points Memo](#)
- [The Caucus](#)
- [The Two-Way](#)
- [Think Tank](#)
- [Threat Level](#)

- [Transitionland](#)
- [Vanity Fair Daily](#)
- [War Room](#)

#### News Sites

- [Al Arabiya](#)
- [Al Jazeera \(English\)](#)
- [ANSA \(English\)](#)
- [Arab News](#)
- [Asharq Al-Awsat](#)
- [Asian Age](#)
- [BBC News](#)
- [BBC World Service](#)
- [CBC](#)
- [Channel 4 News](#)
- [Clarín](#)
- [CNN](#)
- [Corriere della Sera](#)
- [Corriere Della Sera \(English\)](#)
- [Daily Star, Lebanon](#)
- [Dawn](#)
- [Egypt Independent](#)
- [El Mundo](#)
- [El País](#)
- [Express Tribune](#)
- [Financial Times](#)
- [Globo.com](#)
- [Google News](#)
- [Guardian.co.uk](#)
- [Haaretz](#)
- [IBNLive.com](#)
- [Irish Times](#)
- [Lanacion.com](#)

- [LATimes.com](#)
- [Le Monde](#)
- [McClatchy](#)
  
- [MSNBC](#)
- [NDTV](#)
- [NPR](#)
- [O Globo](#)
- [ProPublica](#)
- [PubliCola](#)
- [Rayogram/News](#)
- [Reuters](#)
- [Rue89](#)
- [Russia Today](#)
- [Soitu](#)
- [Spiegel \(English\)](#)
- [Sydney Morning Herald](#)
- [Tehelka](#)
- [Tehran Bureau](#)
- [The Associated Press](#)
- [The Globe and Mail](#)
- [The Local \(Berlin\)](#)
- [The Mail and Guardian](#)
- [The National](#)
- [The New York Times](#)
- [The News \(Pakistan\)](#)
- [The Seattle Times](#)
- [The Telegraph](#)
- [The Wall Street Journal](#)
- [The Wires: A.P.](#)
- [The Wires: Reuters](#)
- [Today's Zaman](#)
- [Voice of San Diego](#)
- [Washingtonpost.com](#)

- [ZDF](#)

#### News Video

- [Al Jazeera Video](#)
- [AP Video](#)
- [BBC News Video](#)
- [BBC One Minute World News](#)
- [Channel 4 News Video](#)
- [Cine Institute](#)
- [CitizenTube](#)
- [Euronews/nocomment](#)
  
- [Guardian Video](#)
- [ITN Video](#)
- [Magma](#)
- [NYT.com Video](#)
- [Pathe Newsreel Archive](#)
- [Reuters Video](#)
- [Sky News](#)
- [Telegraph TV](#)

#### TicketWatch: Theater Offers by E-Mail







## Disruptions: How Driverless Cars Could Reshape Cities

[ALSO IN GLOBAL TECH »](#)

- [A New Tool Aims to Help Facebook Users Dig Deep](#)
- [A Trip to Camp to Break a Tech Addiction](#)

**The New York Times | International Herald Tribune**

[Follow The New York Times »](#)

- [Facebook](#)
- [Twitter](#)
- [YouTube](#)
- [RSS](#)
  
- [© 2013 The New York Times Company](#)
- [Site Map](#)
- [Privacy](#)
- [Your Ad Choices](#)
- [Advertise](#)
- [Terms of Sale](#)
- [Terms of Service](#)
- [Work With Us](#)
- [RSS](#)
- [Help](#)

- [Contact Us](#)
- [Site Feedback](#)